

HARMONY AND INTEGRATED THEORY: FOUR RECENT TEXTS

MARY WENNERSTROM

Theory teachers are always searching for an improved curriculum and for better teaching materials. In the United States and in other English-speaking countries, where a national theory curriculum is not prescribed, teachers change basic texts and approaches frequently. We open the packages that arrive from publishers with distressing regularity, hoping to find the answer to our problems: a text with clearer explanations, better-designed assignments, superior organization, and more helpful references.

In the last two or three years several important theory books—some new, some revisions of earlier editions—have appeared. This article surveys four texts published since 1985,¹ designed for the written portion of a curriculum. The books reflect two of the most common undergraduate music-major plans of study: the harmony course (a one- or two-year sequence covering diatonic and chromatic common-practice harmony) and the integrated course (four- or five-semester sequence including harmony, melody, counterpoint, form, and style, proceeding either chronologically or by topic). The harmony texts to be reviewed here are the fifth edition of Piston's *Harmony* (with even more revisions by Mark DeVoto), accompanied by a workbook/anthology by Arthur Jannery, and a new series of books by Allen Winold (two texts and two workbooks entitled *Harmony: Patterns and Principles*). Both have an informal instructor's manual available from the publishers. The integrated books are the third edition of Benward's *Music in Theory and Practice* (two texts, two workbooks, workbook solutions, instructor's manuals, and CAI materials) and *Music Theory* by Earl Henry (two texts, study guides, instructor's manual). Both Benward and Henry have also published aural-skills books and CAI material to be used for ear training and sightsinging classes, thus providing pedagogical courses for a comprehensive, integrated theory curriculum. These aural-skills sources will be discussed in a later issue of this journal.

Walter Piston's *Harmony* was first published in 1941, following his *Principles of Harmonic Analysis* of 1933. *Harmony* marked "a

JOURNAL OF MUSIC THEORY PEDAGOGY

return to the practical philosophy of theory",² an observation of common practice rather than acoustical speculation. The third edition of *Harmony*, the last that Piston wrote, was published in 1962. By this time the book had become established as one of the best-selling theory textbooks in the United States; "harmony" for many teachers and students was synonymous with Piston the way "music history" is with Grout. The third edition was accompanied by a workbook by Paul des Marais, which included written and keyboard exercises and additional explanatory text. Before Piston's death in 1976, he began work on a fourth edition, in collaboration with one of his former students, Mark DeVoto. Piston/4 (revised by DeVoto) appeared in 1978, accompanied by a workbook by Arthur Jannery, the two authors involved in Piston/5. DeVoto, in addition to rearranging chapters, added new sections on the minor mode, on melodic structure and function, harmonic analysis, and, most controversially, four chapters on "after common practice"—harmony in music of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Although Piston stated in the preface to the third edition, "It is well to emphasize again that the primary concern [of this book] is to provide an understanding of the common practice of composers, in matters of harmony, as observed in music of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries",³ DeVoto argued that his complete reworking of Piston's approach was still true to the original author's ideas and had been tacitly approved by Piston.⁴

Piston/DeVoto/5 retains all of the additions of the fourth edition and makes further changes in Piston's original text. The first impression is generally of a lighter tone, beginning with the publisher's advertising ("Now the Fifth Edition is destined to become the dominant fifth") and of an improved visual format. The book is wider with spacious margins and attractive layout; indeed, it is the most elegantly produced of the four texts here. DeVoto, in a majority of chapters, has retained most of Piston's original concepts, explanations, and examples. Naturally, Piston's influential concept of secondary dominants is intact (although again presented very late in the book). Three other ideas, which set apart this text from others (a chapter on harmonic rhythm, the definition of *appoggiatura* as an accented nonharmonic tone, no matter how the note is approached, and the incomplete dominant ninth chord) all appear in Piston/DeVoto/5, although DeVoto says in an informal letter to fellow teachers (inserted in the workbook) that "it's really OK to leave out this or that chapter, or even to use VII⁷ when I say V^{o9}." Gone, however, are Piston's terms *échappée* and *cambiata* (they became escape tone and reaching tone in the fourth edition), and masculine and feminine cadences are in the fifth edition "downbeat and upbeat cadences," since the gender-specific

FOUR RECENT TEXTS

terms "are no longer used."⁵ DeVoto has again rearranged chapters and added one on texture, a short presentation that mixes terms in describing musical media with various homophonic concepts and that does nothing to clarify a difficult subject. The chapter on the harmonic structure of the phrase (9 in the fourth edition, 13 in the fifth) has been expanded to include a brief discussion of more terms relating to form (period, double period, binary, and ternary make a short appearance), and the chapter on harmonic rhythm now includes a section on the strength of harmonic progressions (to be found in Piston/3 but eliminated in Piston/DeVoto/4). The helpful indexes and cross-referencing of examples have been retained. Such changes are typical throughout the new edition.

In general, the text, especially the beginnings of chapters, has become more DeVoto and less Piston. Literal quotes from Piston/3 occur scattered throughout, sometimes as infrequently as every fifth or tenth sentence. They have the disconcerting familiarity of well-known record jacket notes, appearing without citation in a poor student's analysis paper. The beginnings of the last three editions illustrate DeVoto's move away from Piston's straightforward approach:⁶

"The unit of harmony is the interval." Piston, third edition

"Most music is made up of *tones*, defined as sounds having specific frequencies of pitch." Piston/DeVoto, fourth edition

"Music is indigenous to virtually every culture and every civilization." Piston/DeVoto, fifth edition

The musical examples continue to be short, presented in piano score only. Exercises are the familiar figured and unfigured bass and melodic harmonization problems of previous editions. Appendix II (Supplemental Exercises) has been cut; instead, the workbook presents (for only the first fourteen chapters of the text) a variety of materials: short exercises, analytical projects, composition activities, and self tests, based on words summarized at the beginning of each workbook unit. The new aspect of the workbook is a 100-page anthology of fifty or so short homophonic compositions, arranged alphabetically by composer with no commentary. The choice of these works reflects the evident determination of the authors to "lighten up": in addition to such omnipresent favorites as the theme of Mozart's A Major Piano Sonata, K. 331, I, there are familiar songs ("America," "Beautiful Dreamer," and as the last two entries, Jimmy Webb's "Up, Up and Away" and Sid Woloshin's and Kevin Gavin's "You Deserve a Break Today," a.k.a. the McDonald's commercial), and a bebop version of "Praise God from Whom All Blessings Flow." The anthology also

JOURNAL OF MUSIC THEORY PEDAGOGY

includes, for no apparent reason, obscurities such as a recitative from Scene III of Donizetti's opera *Betty*, an unremarkable excerpt with two different chromatically-connected V⁷-I progressions under an untranslated Italian text. It is hard to know what Piston would think of these selections, but a teacher would probably be better served by anthologies such as *Music for Analysis* (Benjamin, Horvit, and Nelson) or *Music Sources* (Arlin, Lord, Ostrander, and Porterfield),⁷ which present a much wider variety of musical excerpts grouped by harmonic content.

Piston/DeVoto *Harmony* (fifth edition) is not for any teacher who wishes a structural approach to harmony, such as is the basis for the Aldwell/Schachter, Lester, or Forte texts,⁸ nor for anyone who wishes a pedagogically systematic, ordered, and musically varied approach to harmony. If one wants a fairly concise presentation of harmony (with Piston's idiosyncratic symbols and concepts) and is not particularly concerned about ordering (the dominant seventh, for instance, is still presented after chapters on cadences, the harmonic structure of the phrase, form, and modulation), and agree with DeVoto's approach to twentieth-century harmony as presented in the fourth edition, then the fifth edition will be welcome. It retains most of the changes of the fourth edition, includes more of DeVoto's prose, and is in a more attractive format.

Those theory teachers who approach harmony more systematically, using symbols more generally accepted (e.g., the nonchord-tone terminology and Roman-numeral symbols of harmony books such as those by Ottman and Kostka/Payne⁹) will find in the new books by Winold a well-worked out harmonic approach that is much more carefully ordered and comprehensive than Piston's. Winold points out that the purposes of his books are to present harmonic *patterns* (basic chord progressions that appear in Roman-numeral symbols, notes, and scale-degree notation), combined with harmonic *principles* (guidelines for selecting, constructing, and connecting chords). These ideas are worked out in two volumes of text (diatonic and chromatic harmony), in which clear explanations and musical examples are combined with extensive exercises. The exercises are enough to keep any class busy and range from very structured drill problems to "longer and more varied exercises": writing and analysis examples designed for more student creativity within specified guidelines. The companion workbooks are harmonic-keyboard and ear-training exercises (instead of more written problems like Piston) with the answers to the short drill exercises given in the text. The ear-training sections are set up with blank spaces for the students to write in

FOUR RECENT TEXTS

and, in the back, the material to be played by the teacher, so that the workbooks can be used as a harmonic ear-training text.

Winold adopts throughout a straight-forward, exhortatory tone, addressing the student directly ("Apply these principles as you harmonize the melodies." "Search your own repertoire for short . . . progressions . . . and copy at least three into your notebook."¹⁰). Some teachers (and some brighter students!) may feel constricted or bored by the detailed rules ("guidelines"), the 66 basic-chord progressions presented in great detail (with each possible soprano-note position), and the discipline of the repetitive exercises. However, the books, in the hands of a skilled teacher, offer flexibility: the short, programmed-like exercises (with answers given in the workbooks) provide more help than a source such as the Harder texts,¹¹ and can be covered independently by students who need them, while the teacher concentrates on larger matters. The extensive rules and basic progressions are useful summaries of the complete structure of functional harmony and part writing. They function as the basis for chapter discussions and appear in the appendices for reference as well. The rules naturally can be more loosely applied by the teacher after the student learns the fundamental concepts. The ordering of the text is based on the ordering of these basic chord progressions: I-V-I is expanded first by inversions and by V7 and its inversions, next by the addition of the subdominant (I-IV-V-I), next by various substitutions (ii for IV, vii for V), and so on. This order of presentation of harmonic materials, of course, is completely different from Piston's ordering and is much closer to the structural view of authors such as Aldwell/Schachter: I-V(7)-I is the fundamental unit, with ever more complex prolongational possibilities.

Winold expands this skillfully paced harmonic exposition of basic units (which continues throughout the two volumes) by references to various theorists and harmonic systems. For instance, figured-bass symbols, Riemann's T, S, and D, and Schenker's reductive methods are all explained with clear summaries, and some of their symbols and concepts are incorporated into Winold's presentation and into the exercises. Harmonic study is also relieved by "interludes." Volume I includes two on melody: a clear discussion of considerations for melodic analysis and writing, and an illustration of various melodic-motivic operations (inversions, diminution, etc.). There is also an interlude on counterpoint, which follows Fux's species approach and unites it with harmonic (tonal) counterpoint. Volume II includes an interlude on timbre and dynamics (a list of instrument names and ranges, dynamic and character terms, and brief discussions of context) and one on form, the least complete section in the text (short presentations and analysis

JOURNAL OF MUSIC THEORY PEDAGOGY

of sectional forms, sonata allegro, and contrapuntal forms). None of these topics is covered in the Piston/DeVoto book, except for the sketchy presentation on melody. Winold's interludes would have to be considerably amplified by the teacher, if the topics were included in a class; the workbook material for these sections consists mostly of musical examples (rather than exercises) to be approached as directed by the teacher. The summaries in these interludes are useful, however, and could point the way to counterpoint and form study at a more advanced level.

Many of the musical excerpts and exercises, in volumes I and II, are derived from Bach chorales and Beethoven piano sonatas. The choices are carefully ordered and a student could obtain an understanding of these two fundamental musical sources by working conscientiously through the texts. Other examples are drawn from well-known composers ranging from Monteverdi through Brahms; a few appear in more complicated score formats. Teachers should check examples and exercises, however, for incorrect symbols; several figured-bass ones have mistakes. At the end of Volume II, chapters 27-28 present extended tertian and non-tertian chords (including various twentieth-century examples and a chart on jazz chord symbols) and integer notation, which includes a clear summary of some of the ideas presented in sources such as Allen Forte's *The Structure of Atonal Music*.¹²

One final comment should be made about the brief, but insightful, Teacher's Manual that is available for the Winold books. It is really just a small pamphlet and, in comparison to the more weighty chapter-by-chapter guides and extensive answer keys of other texts, might strike casual readers as too skimpy to be of real value. It is, however, brimming with practical advice not just about how to use his own harmony books but with many perceptive suggestions about theory teaching in general. It is, in fact, a presentation (in outline form) of a complete philosophy for music theory teaching in general—a kind of mini theory pedagogy textbook for all subjects. In this regard it is clear that the information in this little book (especially the psychology of classroom dynamics) has been gleaned from many years of thoughtful classroom experience.

These two new texts (Piston/DeVoto and Winold) provide different options for those teachers convinced that a solid background in common-practice harmony should form the core of a music theory curriculum. Winold's is the more comprehensive and the more carefully-worked out pedagogically. It includes extensive harmonic keyboard and ear-training exercises not found in Piston/DeVoto. Winold's summaries of progressions and part writing will be handy references for

FOUR RECENT TEXTS

any teacher; the basic progressions, notated in C major and C minor at the back of the workbook for Volume II, could form the backbone of any keyboard harmony class. Piston/DeVoto/5 gives the teacher more material (exercises, musical examples) than in previous editions; Winold gives so many possibilities that, at least in the harmony chapters, the problem will be one of choosing and simplifying, rather than expanding and elaborating.

Benward's *Music in Theory and Practice* and Henry's *Music Theory* are texts written for a much different sort of undergraduate theory curriculum, one that assumes that harmony study will be immediately combined with, or preceded by, study of other musical elements. An early text of this sort, covering melody, counterpoint, and form as well as harmony, was *Materials and Structure of Music*¹³ (first edition 1966). Later texts, such as those by Cooper and then Baur,¹⁴ have added more historical background or even a chronological presentation of materials. Benward's text first appeared in 1977 and has undergone various changes through its three editions. The two volumes include all the topics of *Materials and Structure*, plus stylistic information about music ranging from Renaissance polyphony to American popular song, blues, boogie, and jazz. Benward, however, clearly aims at less sophisticated students and less experienced teachers than do other integrated books. As in previous editions, much of the presentation is in outline format: theoretical materials combined with a music appreciation overview. Sentences are short. Vocabulary is unchallenging.

One positive feature for many is the very complete instructor's manual: syllabus, lecture notes for each chapter, classroom procedures, answers to each assignment (even the simplest), bibliography, and review quizzes with answers. In short, the texts may be useful for the busy teacher who is not a theory specialist and who is confronted by minimally-prepared students. Even in such a pressured situation, however, the teacher should examine Benward's book critically. Although many things about the book are helpful, some of the ideas presented are misleading, if, in fact, not actually wrong.

The third edition retains the first chapters on fundamentals, useful for establishing a basic musical vocabulary. A unit on "The Anatomy of Harmony" is followed by chapter 4, "The Anatomy of Melody." In the second edition's chapter 4, Benward defined step progression and explored structural tones ("a melody tone of maximum importance" produced by its position, register, or by durational and dynamic accent¹⁵), secondary tones, and embellishing tones. (Compare

JOURNAL OF MUSIC THEORY PEDAGOGY

Hindemith's ideas on melody, and the terms presented in *Materials and Structure*: basic pitches, secondary pitches, decorative pitches.) In Benward's third edition, however, Chapter 4 is newly written by H. Lee Riggins and attempts to examine the structural line of a melody by reference to Schenker, although melody is completely separated from a harmonic context. Structural tones are now defined as 3-2-1, 5-4-3-2-1, and 8-7-6-5-4-3-2-1 patterns (Riggins does not use carats to indicate scale degrees). Secondary tones and embellishing tones have become prolongational and secondary prolongational tones, indicated by different-sized noteheads and various slur markings.

It is hard to see the point of this chapter, since clearly it is not a complete nor very accurate presentation of Schenker's ideas. Nor does Chapter 4 relate to the rest of Benward's text. The most obvious disjunction is the beginning of Chapter 5, in the third edition identical to the beginning of Chapter 5 in the second edition: "In the previous chapter, the function of melodic tones, the interaction of structural, secondary, and embellishing tones with step progressions, and the basic point and direction of melody were discussed."¹⁶ This is not true in the new edition, and worse, the definition of "structural" has been completely changed. Benward later makes a few passing references to searching for a 3-2-1 line, but in no way does the new chapter 4 give students tools for understanding Schenkerian hierarchical levels or for performing melodic structural reduction. Teachers would be better served by using Chapter 4 from the *second* edition or, for a structural approach, referring students to books such as Aldwell/Schachter or to articles such as the summaries by Forte and by Beach.¹⁷

Presumably at the request of those teachers who use the book, Benward has added to the third edition more chorale phrases, beginning in Chapter 7 of Volume I and continuing throughout much of Volume 2. Figured-bass exercises and additional harmonic completion problems occur at the ends of chapters. He has also added to Volume I a chapter entitled "Shorthand Analysis: An Alternative Analytical System," a chapter that is slightly expanded in Volume II. The goal of this system is harmonic reduction and the identification of "target chords." Students reduce the musical context to root-position, closely-spaced chords, written in the bass clef, a Rameau-like fundamental bass that includes the entire chord instead of only roots. Voice leading and spacing are ignored and chords are usually labeled without inversions (although here Benward is inconsistent). The reduction is examined for root motion and possible modulations and is further reduced to target (goal) chords; various symbols identify certain types of harmonic direction and motion. Benward is clearly aiming at a larger, more structural understanding of harmony, certainly a laudable

FOUR RECENT TEXTS

goal that should be a vital component of any functional harmony class. His system, though, does not allude to harmonic levels as such (reductions and further reductions are not related by being placed on top of each other or by showing any type of hierarchical interdependency). And by disregarding voice leading, the bass clefs are disconcertingly full of parallel fifths and unresolved sevenths. Teachers may find the shorthand system helpful as a first step for students; but perhaps more elegant reductions can be demonstrated in class.

Benward continues to cover a wide variety of subjects in the two volumes. The first volume, in addition to melody and diatonic harmony, presents chapters on instrumentation, style periods, two- and three-part form, and American popular music. Volume 2 covers chromatic harmony and specific styles and forms (Renaissance polyphony, eighteenth-century counterpoint and fugue, variations, sonata allegro, rondo, and twentieth-century music), with chapters on general procedures followed by Benward's analysis of a specific piece and complete works for the student to analyze. Some of these chapters are very general and teachers should be aware of potentially misleading statements. Chapters 9 and 10 in Volume I, as in previous editions, are particularly sketchy, since in seven pages they cover style periods from the Renaissance to the present including a parametric checklist, with short definitions, to be used for stylistic analysis.

Teachers should skip Benward's explanation of set theory in Volume 2, Chapter 22, presented in conjunction with a study of Bartók's "Chromatic Invention" (*Mikrokosmos* No. 91). Benward mentions Leibowitz, Babbitt, and Forte, and proceeds to definitions: "The atonal (nontonal) analysis system is known as *set theory* and is based on any ordered collection of *pitch classes*." "The term *set* means an ordered group of pitch classes such as C, D, and E."¹⁸ Compare Forte's definition: "The pitch-class set is an unordered set and differs basically, for example, from the ordered 12-tone row, in which considerations of order-position are crucial."¹⁹ Benward is confusing ordered and unordered collections and continues by introducing his own definitions of normal order and prime form. Any teacher who wishes to present set theory as a possible analytical tool should send students directly to sources such as Forte's own summary.²⁰

In this third edition, Benward has retained his broad coverage, both of musical styles and of elements studied. The text has been popular with some teachers because of its straight-forward style and the guidance given to the teacher. Benward explains basic material clearly; students learn functional harmony quite well and get at least a smattering of musical styles and compositional techniques ranging from the sixteenth century to the present. The third edition offers more

JOURNAL OF MUSIC THEORY PEDAGOGY

harmonic exercises and presents a harmonic reductive analytical method that students and teachers may find useful, particularly as a first step. The volumes appear to have fewer mistakes than in previous editions. However, in his attempt to include references to currently popular analytical systems, Benward has missed basic concepts of both Schenkerian analysis and of set theory and clearly has not integrated either system with other topics. Teachers should ignore the methodological parts of this text, referring the students, if the systems are introduced, to primary sources. Benward's analyses and stylistic overviews will also need to be clarified and amplified by the conscientious teacher.

Earl Henry's set of books, *Music Theory*, is an alternative for those teachers presently using Benward, *Materials and Structure*, Cooper, or Baur. The two volumes combine text and workbook; each chapter contains short drills and longer analytical and compositional problems. Study guides provide more background information, supplementary exercises and answers, and study questions in both a programmed and open-ended format. An instructor's manual contains a course syllabus, notes and suggestions for the teacher, and sample examinations, although it is much less extensive than Benward's guide. The study guides and instructor's manual appear to be notes directly from a word processor (or even a typewriter!) and need to be proofread again. The first two pages of the instructor's manual, for instance, include at least five mistakes in the text.

The text volumes, however, are much more carefully written and produced. Henry's style is clear and direct; he often manages to summarize complex ideas without missing the main points. His approach emphasizes the historical context of each subject, in a more expanded and organized way than the one-volume Cooper text, and from the beginning students are urged to analyze actual musical excerpts and to compose their own. The first volume begins, as does Benward, with fundamentals, but moves, very quickly, into two rather detailed chapters on rhythm that demonstrate Henry's approach: rhythmic and metric terms are defined and illustrated in music ranging from a thirteenth-century motet to Bernstein's *West Side Story*. Students are given a complete checklist for analysis and are asked to contrast rhythmically-different examples. They are also asked to compose a work for percussion ensemble.

Volume I continues with chapters on the tonal system, modulation, and form and analysis, including two chapters on melody and one on binary and ternary form. Henry points out that, although he presents an overview of chords and tonality, part writing and harmonization

FOUR RECENT TEXTS

are delayed until the second volume. This underemphasis on harmony is one of the distinctive (and many teachers will say disturbing) features of the text. Where Winold's texts might be regarded as "harmonic overdose," Henry's volumes can certainly almost qualify as "harmonic starvation." Winold's detailed rules have been reduced in Henry to a one-page checklist for four-part writing; chord-connection guidelines are simply "Obey 'Law of the Shortest Way'."²¹ As Henry laconically comments in the instructor's manual, "Instructors who want to emphasize part writing in the freshman year will need to furnish supplementary materials."²²

Volume 2 begins with eighteenth-century style (fugue, tonal counterpoint, chorale harmonization, figured bass, and variation). Here part writing makes a rather brief appearance. Henry continues with chromatic and romantic materials (including chapters on the sonata and rondo) and 100 pages on the twentieth century. Again, he combines historical perspective, analysis of extended musical excerpts, and open-ended composition projects, with a few short drill problems added along the way. Although Henry covers basically the same territory as Benward, the books are less harmonically oriented, emphasizing general understanding, analysis, and individual creativity rather than drill or harmonic reduction. Henry also avoids the specific stylistic and composer-oriented information presented in Benward and does not include sixteenth-century polyphony nor American popular music, although there is a short appendix on "The Materials of Jazz." Many of the explanations in *Music Theory* are interesting and musical, but they would have to be supplemented by the teacher with more rigorous exercises and additional discussion.

Henry is different from Benward, too, in the theories he introduces. While Benward dabbles unsatisfactorily in Schenker and [Forte's] set theory, Henry presents clear summaries of his theoretical underpinnings and integrates them into the text rather well. It is the *choice* of theories that is surprising: Henry chooses those popular at influential music schools 30 or 40 years ago instead of 3 or 4. The explanation of tonality (Volume I, Chapter 7) depends on "the theory of primary function" (Henry references Ratner, 1962²³) and on McHose's "theory of chord classification" (McHose, 1947²⁴). McHose's ideas reappear in Chapter 3 of Volume 2 (harmonization of chorale melodies), although fortunately Henry uses the Roman numeral symbols and cadence symbology of Kostka/Payne rather than that of McHose.²⁵ The twentieth-century section presents chord analysis and concepts of set theory, as explained by Howard Hanson.²⁶ Students are asked to calculate "chord chemistry"; the results, of course, are the same as interval vectors. For example, $P^2M^2N^3SDT$ equals [113221],

JOURNAL OF MUSIC THEORY PEDAGOGY

the vector for Forte's set 5-32, since each method summarizes the number of appearances of the six interval classes, although reported in different order. Henry spends quite a bit of time on chord chemistry; he also explains and drills on concepts such as set transposition and inversion (ordered and unordered), inclusion, and complement.

Hindemith's ideas are also represented in the text, not surprisingly, since Hanson's ordering of intervals matches Hindemith's in Series 2. In Volume II Henry discusses Hindemith's chord roots, table of chord groups, and harmonic fluctuation.²⁷ Excerpts by Bach, Chopin, and Hindemith are analyzed in Roman numerals and with Hindemith's and Hanson's symbols (*none* of the three systems makes sense as applied to Chopin's E minor Prelude!). Hindemith's melodic analysis is a part of Chapter 13 in Volume I (*Applied Melodic Principles: Analysis and Composition*). The terms structural pitches, secondary pitches, embellishing pitches, and step progression are all related to Hindemith's method of determining melodically prominent notes. (These are the very terms that have disappeared from Benward's melodic chapter in his third edition.) Henry also employs cadential terms similar to those in *Materials and Structure*: terminal and progressive cadences (although fortunately not transient terminal!) appear briefly in Volume I, Chapter 8.

These books by Henry thus represent an analytical-historical approach to music theory that emphasizes examining and composing musical excerpts from the beginning. The texts also present specific theoretical approaches in more detail than is usual in beginning books. The questions teachers will raise about this series are not ones of confusion or inaccuracy; they are ones of balance, emphasis, and choice of theories. One could imagine a lively course based on *Music Theory*, especially if the student group were rather small and the teacher creative and sympathetic to the theoretical concepts presented. However, this series will not be for everyone.

The four books reviewed here range from ones that place common-practice harmony at the center of theoretical study to those that place it in the context of many other types of music and musical elements. Pedagogical approaches vary from following strict rules to expressing minimally-guided compositional creativity. Theoretical systems are ignored or appear in some detail—explained and integrated into the texts with varying degrees of success. Finally, however, a good theory curriculum does not depend on the answers found in the newest text. It depends on musical, well-informed, and enthusiastic teachers, interacting with motivated, conscientious, and able students. These factors help to guarantee that, whatever the choice of text, the study of musical structure will be continually fascinating and challenging.

FOUR RECENT TEXTS

NOTES

¹Walter Piston, *Harmony*, fifth edition, revised by Mark DeVoto (Norton, 1987), workbook by Arthur Jannery; Allen Winold, *Harmony: Patterns and Principles* (Prentice-Hall, 1986); Bruce Benward, *Music in Theory and Practice*, third edition (Wm. C. Brown, 1985); and Earl Henry, *Music Theory* (Prentice-Hall, 1985).

²David M. Thompson, *A History of Harmonic Theory in the United States* (Kent State University Press, 1980), 130.

³Walter Piston, *Harmony*, third edition (Norton, 1962), vii.

⁴Walter Piston, *Harmony*, fourth edition, revised and expanded by Mark DeVoto (Norton, 1978), xiv.

⁵Piston/DeVoto, *Harmony*, fifth edition, 181.

⁶Piston, third edition, 3; Pisto/DeVoto, fourth edition, 1; Piston/DeVoto, fifth edition, 3.

⁷Thomas Benjamin, Michael Horvit, and Robert Nelson, *Music for Analysis*, second edition (Houghton Mifflin, 1984); Mary I. Arlin, Charles H. Lord, Arthur E. Ostrander, and Marjorie S. Porterfield, *Music Sources* (Prentice-Hall, 1979).

⁸Edward Aldwell and Carl Schachter, *Harmony and Voice Leading* (Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1978); Joel Lester, *Harmony in Tonal Music*, 2 vols., Knopf, 1982; Allen Forte, *Tonal Harmony in Concept and Practice*, third edition (Holt, Rinehart, & Winston, 1982).

⁹Robert Ottman, *Elementary Harmony: Theory and Practice* and *Advanced Harmony: Theory and Practice*, third edition (Prentice-Hall, 1983, 1984); Stefan Kostka and Dorothy Payne, *Tonal Harmony* (Alfred A. Knopf, 1984).

¹⁰Winold, I, 83, 85.

¹¹Paul O. Harder, *Harmonic Materials in Tonal Music: A Programmed Course*, fifth edition (Allyn & Bacon, 1985).

¹²Allen Forte, *The Structure of Atonal Music* (Yale University Press, 1973).

¹³William Christ, Richard DeLone, Vernon Kliever, Lewis Rowell, William Thomson, *Materials and Structure of Music* (Prentice-Hall, 1966, 1972, 1980).

JOURNAL OF MUSIC THEORY PEDAGOGY

¹⁴Paul Cooper, *Perspectives in Music Theory: An Historical-Analytical Approach* (Harper & Row, 1973, 1981); John Baur, *Music Theory through Literature* (Prentice-Hall, 1985).

¹⁵Benward, *Music in Theory and Practice*, second edition (Wm. C. Brown, 1981), I, 94.

¹⁶Benward, third edition, I, 99 (compare second edition, I, 103).

¹⁷Allen Forte, "Schenker's Conception of Musical Structure," *Readings in Schenker Analysis and Other Approaches*, edited by Maury Yeston (Yale University Press, 1977), 3-37.

¹⁸Benward, II, 329.

¹⁹Allen Forte, *The Harmonic Organization of the Rite of Spring* (Yale University Press, 1978), 3.

²⁰Forte, *Rite of Spring*, 1-17.

²¹Henry, I, 341.

²²Henry, Instructor's Manual, 46.

²³Leonard Ratner, *Harmony: Structure and Style* (McGraw-Hill, 1962).

²⁴Allen I. McHose, *The Contrapuntal Harmonic Technique of the 18th Century* (Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1947).

²⁵In building augmented sixths, Henry, however, uses an idea from McHose: for Italian and German chords, students are told to begin with the subdominant triad or seventh and raise the root (compare Piston's explanation). French chords are altered supertonic sevenths.

²⁶Howard Hanson, *Harmonic Materials of Modern Music* (Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1960).

²⁷Paul Hindemith, *Craft of Musical Composition*, Book I, revised edition (Associated Music Publishers, 1945).